



Consiglio di Stato



**Seminar organized by the Council of State of Italy and ACA-
Europe**

**“Techniques for the protection of private subjects in
contrast with public authorities: actions and remedies
– liability and compliance”**

Rome, 23 May 2022

Answers to questionnaire: Bulgaria



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

“TECHNIQUES FOR THE PROTECTION OF PRIVATE SUBJECTS IN CONTRAST WITH PUBLIC AUTHORITIES: ACTIONS AND REMEDIES - LIABILITY AND COMPLIANCE”.

INTRODUCTION

The seminar will analyse the types of actions that can be brought before the administrative judge: action of annulment, action of declaration and action of condemnation. With particular reference to the latter, the seminar will focus on compensatory measures, including damages for loss of opportunity and damages as a result of delay.

The seminar also intends to examine the possibility of any and eventual special or fast-track procedure, for introductory terms and methods which pertain to certain subjects under consideration, for example, for their economic or political relevance, such as those to be found in the sphere of public contracts (see also transversal analysis).

The aim of this questionnaire and of the subsequent seminar is to provide a wider comprehension of the similarities and differences that exist among the various legal systems of the member States insofar as they apply to the situations to be dealt with by the administrative court, paying particular attention to the content and subject matter of the relative rulings.

SESSION I

LEGAL PROCEEDINGS THAT CAN BE BROUGHT BEFORE THE ADMINISTRATIVE COURT

- 1. In your legal system, which judges are competent to pronounce on disputes in which one of the parties is the public administration?**
 - An ordinary judge
 - An administrative judge
 - A judge who deals with special areas
 - Others



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, the jurisdiction of the administrative court is defined by art. 103 of the Italian Constitution and by art. 7 of the administrative process code (hereafter to be referred to by the acronym a.p.c.)

The administrative court has jurisdiction with public law litigation in any disputes in which the Public Administration acts by implementing special powers and not according to the terms of common law.

The Bulgarian answer

Administrative courts and the Supreme Administrative Court have full and general jurisdiction over all administrative cases. According to Art. 119, para 1 of the Constitution of the Republic of Bulgaria the administration of justice is carried out by the Supreme Court of Cassation, the Supreme Administrative Court, appellate, district, military and regional courts. Specialized courts may also be established by law. By virtue of this constitutional norm in 2006. The Code of Administrative Procedure was adopted and the system of administrative courts, which are 28 in Republic of Bulgaria, was established.

According to Art. 132. of APC with the jurisdiction of the administrative courts shall be all the administrative cases, except for these, which shall be with the jurisdiction of the Supreme Administrative Court. With the jurisdiction of the Supreme Administrative Court shall be:

1. the contestations against the acts of secondary legislation, except for these of the municipal councils;
2. the contestations against the acts of the Council of Ministers, the Prime Minister, the deputy prime ministers and the ministers, issued while exercising their constitutional powers in the management and performance of government; in the cases provided for by law, as well as when those authorities have delegated their powers to the respective officials, the administrative acts issued by them shall be challenged before the relevant administrative court;
3. the contestations against decisions of the Supreme Judicial Council;
4. the contestations against the bodies of the Bulgarian National Bank;
5. cassation complaints and protests against court decisions of the first instance;
6. private complaints against definitions and orders;



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

7. claims on cancellation of entered into force court acts upon administrative cases;
8. the contestations against other acts, determined by a law.

2. Which actions can be brought before the administrative court in view of the exercise of administrative powers?

- Annulment of administrative acts
- action of condemnation
- Other actions

If you have replied 'other actions', please clarify which.

Italian reply

The administrative process code highlights the following actions:

- Annulment actions of administrative provisions (art. 29 a.p.c.)
- Compensatory actions (art. 30 a.p.c.) and of a sentence to pay out sums of money in specific cases
- Compliance actions, intended as action of condemnation for the release of the requested provision (art. 34 of a.p.c.)
- Action against silence (art. 31 a.p.c.)
- Precautionary action (art 55 a.p.c.)
- Compliance action (art. 112 a.p.c. to be found under various headings of the a.p.c.)
- Any other action deemed suitable to comply with a specific protective measure (art. 34 a.p.c)

The Bulgarian answer

Within the jurisdiction of the administrative courts shall be all the cases upon claims on:

- issue, amendment, cancellation or declaration of invalidity of administrative acts and administrative contracts;
- declaration of invalidity of agreements under APC;
- execution of an administrative contract, unless otherwise provided for by a special law.
- protection against ungrounded actions and inactions of the administration;
- protection against unlawful enforcement;



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

- indemnities for damages from unlawful acts, actions and inactions of administrative bodies and officials, as well as for damages from the judicial activity of the administrative courts and the Supreme Administrative Court;
- indemnities for damages from the enforcement;
- declaration of invalidity, invalidation or cancellation of decisions, pronounced by the administrative courts;
- establishment of the non-authentication of administrative act under this code.

3. From which sources can actions be ~~proposed~~ brought before the administrative court?

- Law
- Public authority regulations
- Guidelines
- Supreme Court rulings
- Other

Italian reply

In our legal system, actions that can be brought before the administrative judge are regulated by law, and specifically, by the a.p.c.

The Bulgarian answer

In the Bulgarian legal system, the sources of jurisdiction of the administrative courts and the SAC are the laws, which include both the APC and a number of substantive and structural laws.

4. Which administrative decisions can be challenged?

- Administrative acts which have a specific recipient
- General acts and regulations
- Acts inherent to the procedure



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

- Political acts

Italian reply

All implemented administrative decisions can be challenged, even those of a general nature, such as regulations. Political acts may not be challenged, namely “those acts or provisions issued by the government in the exercising of its political power” (art. 7, comma 1 a.p.c.). In administrative case law, the notion of a political act is restricted exclusively to those acts issued by constitutional bodies and which represent the exercise of supreme political choices. Endo-procedural acts cannot be challenged autonomously, unless they are not directly harmful.

The Bulgarian answer

According to Art. 120, para. 2 of the Constitution citizens and juridical persons shall be free to contest any administrative act which affects them, except those listed expressly by the laws. The provisions of the APC shall not be applied for the acts:

1. of the National Assembly and of the President of the Republic of Bulgaria;
2. by which a legislative initiative is exercised;
3. by which rights and obligations are established for bodies or organisations, subordinated to the body, who has issued the act, unless by them rights, freedoms or legitimate interests of citizens or legal entities are concerned.

The exceptions for non-appealability, provided in the APC, show that in the Bulgarian legal system the political acts of the state bodies are not subject to appeal.

All administrative acts by type can be appealed before the administrative courts, including the individual administrative acts, the general administrative acts and the by-laws.

5. On the grounds of which defects can the annulment of an administrative act be requested?

- Breaches of the law
- Breaches of competence
- Technicalities and procedural defects
- Breaches of general principles
- Other



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

Italian reply

In accordance with the provisions of art. 21 *octies* of Law 241/1990, breaches of the law, incompetence and misuse of powers are deducible defects. Misuse of power denotes an incorrect application of the administrative function compared to the intentions indicated by the law. The annulment may be requested even in cases of the breach of general principles of the administrative action, among which are the principles of reasonability and proportionality.

In the case of binding activity, the breach of formal rules and procedures (formal defects) cannot result in the annulment of the act, if the content of the acts could not have been any different.

The Bulgarian answer

According to Art. 146 of the APC grounds for contestation of the administrative acts shall be:

1. lack of competence;
2. lack of conformity with the established form;
3. essential breach of the administrative and procedural rules;
4. contradiction to the material legal provisions;
5. non-compliance with the purpose of the law.

The Bulgarian administrative judiciary recognizes two forms of annulment of illegal administrative acts. The two forms differ in the degree and severity of the defect with which the administrative act is affected. Both forms are the nullity of the administrative act, which leads to the annulment of the administrative act. The second form is the invalidity of the administrative act. When the administrative act is affected by the most serious defect, this leads to its invalidity and the administrative court does not annul the administrative act, but declares it invalid. Such an act has no legal effect at all from the moment of its issuance. The APC does not contain an explicit legal norm that indicates when an administrative act is null and void and when it is invalid. However, he points out that when an administrative act is issued by an incompetent body, it always leads to its invalidity. It is assumed that when the requirement for the form of the administrative act is not complied with, there is also a ground for declaring it invalid. The annulment of the administrative act is admissible due to violation of the principle of proportionality.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

6. Can the judge partially annul the challenged administrative act?

- Yes
- No

If your reply is yes, please elaborate.

Italian reply

The administrative judge can partially annul an illegitimate act.

The Bulgarian answer

The administrative court has the power to annul the administrative act in full and in part.

7. Can the judge substitute the Administration by modifying the content of the administrative act?

- Yes
- No

If your reply is yes, please elaborate.

Italian reply

Art 7, comma 6 a.p.c. makes provisions for cases, exhaustively listed by law, in which the judge may reform the act, partially or wholly, by substituting it with another act (so-called extended jurisdiction on the merit).

For example, in electoral litigation, if the judge allows the appeal, he corrects the results of the election and replaces the illegitimately proclaimed candidates with those who are truly entitled (art 130, comma 9 a.p.c.). Other examples of extended jurisdiction on the merit are: a) a compliance proceedings (art 112 a.p.c.) in which the judge, if he allows the appeal, may order compliance by prescribing the procedure, including by means of the determination of the content of the administrative decision or the enactment of the same instead of the administration” (art 114, comma 4, letter a), a.p.c.); b) the judges dealing with financial penalties including those imposed by almost all independent administrative authorities, in which if the judge allows the appeal, may modify the amount of the financial penalty if he deems that the quantification of the amount does not comply with the parameters indicated by law.

The Bulgarian answer



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The administrative judge has the power to decide the administrative law issue instead of the administrative body, when it annuls the administrative act, only when this is explicitly stated in the specific substantive administrative law under which the administrative act is issued. In all cases, in the case of an administrative appeal, the court is obliged to assess whether the matter has been referred to the administrative body or the court. Depending on the answer to this question are the subsequent procedural actions of the court. In cases where the matter is not left to the discretion of the administrative body, the court decides with the authority after revoking the act. In other cases, when the matter is left to the discretion of the administrative body, the court annuls the administrative act and returns the file to the administrative body with instructions for the lawful application of the substantive or procedural law.

8. When the judge annuls the challenged act, can he dictate provisions which the P.A. must abide by in the review proceedings of the subject-matter of the litigation?

- Yes
- No

If your reply is affirmative, please elaborate.

Italian reply

One of the effects of the decision of the administrative court is the so called “conformity effect “: that is to say, the judge can dictate conditions which must be adhered to when the Administration makes new provisions after the annulment.

The Bulgarian answer

Yes, the answer to this question is part of the answer to the previous question.

9. When do the effects of the jurisdictional annulment of an administrative act become applicable?

- From the date of the adoption of the act (*ex tunc*)
- From the date on which the judgement becomes final (*ex nunc*)
- Other

Italian reply



Co-funded by
the European Union



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The annulment of an act in the seat of jurisdiction produces retroactive effects, that is to say from the date of adoption of the act in question (“*ex tunc*”)

The Bulgarian answer

As in the Italian administrative justice, the annulment of the individual and general administrative act has the effect of issuing the administrative act, (“*ex tunc*”). However, when a by-law is repealed, the repeal of the by-law shall take effect in the future from the date on which the judgement becomes final (*ex nunc*).

10. Can the judge modulate the effects over time of the ruling of annulment of an administrative act?

- Yes
- No
- Other

Italian reply

In certain specific precedents, in order to ensure effective protection, the Council of State limited itself to ascertaining the illegality of the act and to indicate conformative requirements (*pro future*) for the subsequent exercise of public function.

With regard to special procedure of public tenders, the judge who declares the contract to be ineffective establishes the starting date from which it becomes ineffective and this may be subsequent to the date of the sentence.

The Bulgarian answer

The judge can not modulate the effects over time of the ruling of annulment of an administrative act.

11. Can the act of ordering payments for damages be proposed autonomously or must it always be proposed together with other kinds of actions?

- Yes
- No
- Only in certain cases

If your reply is yes, please elaborate



Co-funded by
the European Union



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

Italian reply

Art 30, comma 1, a.p.c. requires that the compensatory action must be proposed in two ways:

- a) at the same time as other actions (action of annulment, action against silence etc.); b) autonomously.

The autonomous compensation for damages action must be proposed within a time-limit of 120 days from the fact itself or from the awareness of the fact which caused the damage (art 30, comma 3, a.p.c.).

The Bulgarian answer

The compensatory remedy is a claim for damages from the effect of the illegal administrative act. It may be presented together with the challenge of the administrative act before the administrative court or separately from it. When a claim for damages is filed by illegal administrative acts, the requirement of the APC is that the administrative act be revoked in accordance with the relevant procedure in advance. In the cases when the claim for damages is filed together with the challenge, the court of the dispute shall also rule on the claim for damages. When the claim is based on damages from illegal actions or inactions of the administration, the court hearing the case on the claim for damages incidentally rules on the lawfulness of the actions and inactions. In this case, it is not necessary to appeal them in advance and declare them illegal, regardless of the fact that such proceedings under the APC are provided.

12. In the light of what kind of behaviour is the compensatory action for damages feasible when dealing with a Public Administration?

- Implementation of an illegal and detrimental administrative act
- Non-observance of the deadline of the procedure
- Lesion of good faith and trust
- Resultant behaviour of the public administration
- Other

Please elaborate

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, all detrimental conditions indicated above are relevant for compensatory damages



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The Bulgarian answer

As in Italian administrative justice, all circumstances are capable of causing harm to citizens, so that all can be sued for damages.

13. Which are the different kinds of reimbursable damages?

- Material damage
- Non-material damage
- Loss of opportunity

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, all detrimental conditions indicated above are relevant for compensatory damages

The Bulgarian answer

The answer is the same as in the Italian justice.

14. Does the omission of lodging an action of annulment result in elision or reduction of the compensatory damages?

- Yes
- No
- Other

Italian reply

On the occasion of quantifying the amount of damages, the administrative court must exclude all damages “which could have been avoided by due diligence, also through the use of the instruments of protection provided” (art 30, comma 3, a.p.c.).

The Bulgarian answer

The Bulgarian legal system has adopted the understanding that is in the Italian legal system. When the injured party was able to reduce the amount of damages by his conduct and the care of a good owner, this has an impact on the amount of compensation.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

15. In order to award compensatory damages, is proof of the responsibility of the public administration required? If your reply is affirmative, which party is obliged to provide said proof?

- Yes – the party with burden of proof is...
- No

Italian reply

The injured party must provide proof of the responsibility of the public administration. Case law, however, recognises only some less onerous burdens of proof, by admitting some presumption of liability. As far as tenders are concerned, in compliance with the Court of Justice case law, the injured party is instead exempted from providing proof of liability of the contracting authority.

The Bulgarian answer

According to the Bulgarian Law on the Liability of the State and Municipalities for Damages, the liability of the public administration is objective and regardless of guilt. This means that the state will owe compensation for damages to the injured person, regardless of whether the administrative body or the official is to blame for the damages caused. Guilt for the damage is not part of the factual composition of the liability. However, the applicant must prove the other elements of liability, namely the damage suffered and the direct causal link between the unlawful administrative act or action and the damage.

16. Can the judge convert *ex officio* one action into another?

- Yes
- No

If the reply is yes, please elaborate

Italian reply

No. If all the requisite conditions exist, the judge can always provide for the conversion of the action (art 32, comma 2, a.p.c.)

The Bulgarian answer

The answer is the same as in the Italian reply.

17. Is there a time-limit for the proposition of the compensatory action?



Co-funded by
the European Union



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

- Yes
- No

If the reply is yes, please elaborate

Italian reply

See reply to question 10.

The Bulgarian answer

The term according to the Bulgarian law is statute of limitations and is 5 years from the date of the annulment of the administrative act.

18. Can the judge rule that the Administration implement an administrative act? If your reply is affirmative, what are the prerequisites for implementation?

- Yes – explain
- No

Italian reply:

The administrative judge can rule that the administration issue a provision which had been requested but illegitimately denied when it is in the realm of bound activity or when no investigations are required that have to be carried out by the administration” (art 34, comma 1, letter c).

The Bulgarian answer

When it annuls an unlawful refusal of the administrative body to issue an administrative act, the court shall oblige it to issue the administrative act.

When obliging the body to issue an administrative act or document, the court shall set a term for that.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

SESSION II – SPECIAL PROCEDURES

1. Does your administration have provisions for special procedures

- Yes
- No

If the reply is yes, please elaborate

Italian reply

The administrative process code has provisions for the following special procedures: the procedure regarding access to administrative documents ex art. 116 a.p.c.; appeals against silence ex art. 117 a.p.c.; injunction procedures ex art. 118 a.p.c.; ex art. 119 a.p.c. abbreviated trial with regard to specific matters for example, public tenders, tender procedure ex art. 120 a.p.c., electoral procedure ex art. 130 a.p.c.

The Bulgarian answer

The Bulgarian Administrative Procedure Code does not contain special administrative procedures. It contains procedures for issuing individual, general and normative acts, court proceedings on their appeal, court proceedings for claims for damages from illegal administrative acts, proceedings for execution of administrative acts and proceedings for protection against illegal administrative actions and omissions. According to the Bulgarian legislation, all special administrative procedures and the right to issue administrative acts in the respective field are regulated in special substantive administrative laws. The procedural rules of the APC apply to their issuance and appeal.

2. What do the specialities consist of?

- Ways of introducing the appeal
- Procedural time-limits
- Jurisdiction of the court
- Other

Italian reply

Special procedures provide for a series of derogatory regulations compared to ordinary regulations. They generally comply with a fast-track logic by introducing reduced procedural time-limits, simplified procedures, types of decision which are different to the judgement (decree, a judgement in a simplified format).



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The Bulgarian answer

The APC contains provisions for protection against allowed preliminary execution of administrative acts. The rules contain shorter deadlines for ruling and appeals

3. The special rites are established:

- According to subject (for example, tenders, procedures of expropriation, independent administration authorities)
- According to actions
- Both of the above

Please elaborate

Italian reply

Special procedure regard both specific subjects highlighted in detail in art 119, comma 1, a.p.c. of the administrative trial (for example, tenders, procedures of expropriation, independent administration authorities' actions) and appeals against the silence of the public administration (art. 117 a.p.c.), for access to documents (art. 116 a.p.c.), for compliance (art.112 e ss. a.p.c.), for injunction (art 118 a.p.c.)

4. Does your system provide for appeals against the silence of the Administration at the request for an administrative provision presented by a private individual?

- Yes
- No

If the reply is yes, please elaborate

Italian reply

Art. 31 a.p.c. provides for a specific action adverse to the inertia of the public administration, the procedure of which follows special rules (ascertainment of the duty of the administration to provide). Upon completion, the judge may grant a time-limit within which the Administration must comply. He/she could order the Administration to implement the provision of the required act only if the content is restricted or if discretionary power has been fully exercised.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The Bulgarian answer

The APC regulates the institute of tacit refusal and tacit consent. According to Art. 58 of the APC, the failure to pronounce in time shall be considered by the law as a tacit refusal to issue the administrative act. It is equated in legal consequences to an explicit written administrative act and may be appealed to the court in the same way as an explicit act is appealed. Tacit consent of the administration is available only when a special administrator of the law provides for such.

As for the tacit refusal to appeal, the court may oblige the administrative body to issue the act only when the administration acts with bound jurisdiction.

5. Do the Administrations comply spontaneously with the decisions of the administrative courts?

- Yes, always
- No, never
- In the majority of cases, in any case more than in 50% of cases
- Hardly ever, in any case less than in 50% of cases

Italian reply

The enforcement remedy is used for the execution of about 15% of the SAC judgments.

The Bulgarian answer

In most cases, administrative bodies voluntarily enforce court decisions of administrative courts and the SAC.

6. In your legal system, is there a special procedure for ensuring the integral execution of the sentence?

- Yes
- No

If the reply is yes, please elaborate

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system a specific procedure for the execution of judgements is provided for (art. 112-114 a.p.c.). Moreover, it provides also for the remedy of the so-called “*astraintes*” for indirect execution. The remedy does not require the judgment to be final.



Co-funded by
the European Union



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

Nevertheless, the powers of the judges of the execution are different in the event that the judgment to be enforced is final or not. In the first case, the judge of the execution can declare null the administrative acts eventually adopted in contrast with the judgment itself and can completely substitute the administration in the execution of the judgment. Instead, if the decision to be enforced is not final, the judge can only indicate to the administration how to give execution to the judgment, considering without effect the administrative acts eventually adopted in contrast with the judgment itself.

The Bulgarian answer

The APC contains an independent part dedicated to the implementation of administrative acts, both against the administration and against citizens and legal entities. The rules of enforcement proceedings are detailed. Opportunities for protection against illegal enforcement are provided as an opportunity to appeal against enforcement actions and claims for damages from illegal enforcement of administrative acts. Enforcement is admissible both of the entered into force court decisions and administrative acts, and of those administrative acts which have not yet entered into force and are being appealed, but their preliminary execution is allowed both by law in the cases provided for that, as well as by order of the administrative body.

7. Are the judge's decisions which are not of the last resort immediately enforceable?

- Yes
- No

If the reply is yes, please elaborate

Italian reply

The decisions of the Regional Administrative Tribunals are immediately enforceable. In compliance with art 98, para. 1, a.p.c., after challenging the decision, a suspension of the enforceability of the decision of the court of first instance and the implementation of other measures which are deemed necessary, can be requested.

The Bulgarian answer

Only those court decisions that have entered into force are subject to immediate execution. They shall not be enforced until the time limit for their appeal has expired, if they are appealable. The unappealable court decisions of the cassation instance are subject to immediate execution.

8. Following the annulment of a decision characterized by discretionary power, the interested party is forced to challenge each of the ulterior negative decisions which have been deemed illegitimate by dint of defects which are different to those identified by the judge or, in alternative, are there certain mechanisms of "reduction" of the



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

aforesaid discretionary power which ensure the definition of the litigation once and for all?

- Yes – elaborate

- No

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, generally speaking, the sentence of the annulment of a decision characterized by discretionary power binds the Administration only when dealing with the illegitimacy identified by the sentence (the so-called “deduction”). The Council of State maintains that, in certain cases, the discretionary power can be “reduced” substantially, both for the effect of an auto-obligation placed by the same public administration, and for the effect of the specific trial outcome (when, for example, the investigation found that there were no other alternative reliable techniques).

The Bulgarian answer

In the Bulgarian legal system, administrative decisions that are the result of exercised discretion are also appealed to the court, but the administrative court only examines the requirements of legality. The court does not have the power to limit the discretion of the administrative body. The court may annul an administrative act issued in the exercise of discretion only if the requirements for its legality, such as the competence of the body, the form of the act, procedural rules, reasons and other requirements of the law are not met.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

SESSION III – PRECAUTIONARY MEASURES

- 1. Does the proposition of an appeal automatically suspend the effectiveness of the administrative act?**
- Yes
 - No

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, the proposition of appeal does not entail suspensive effects

The Bulgarian answer

In principle, the appeal suspends the execution of the administrative act. This is a rule of the APC and is regulated in the APC, but allows exceptions. A number of substantive administrative laws overcome the suspensive effect of the appeal and allow preliminary execution of the administrative act from the moment of its issuance for the period until its entry into force or during the period of its appeal.

- 2. In your legal system, are precautionary measures provided for?**
- Yes
 - No

Italian reply



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

In the Italian legal system, the petitioner can request the issuance of all those precautionary measures which are most suited to avoiding having to undergo serious and irremediable prejudice during the time required to reach a decision on the appeal.

The Bulgarian answer

The APC does not contain special precautionary measures. Only suspension of the implementation of the administrative act is admissible under the APC

3. What kinds of decisions can the judge apply as a precautionary measure?

- The suspension of the challenged act;
- (if the subject of the challenge is the refusal of an application) a positive measure which provisionally anticipates the effects of the administrative act being contested;
- The order to the administration to re-examine the application on the strength of indications contextually provided by the judge;
- Whatever measure necessary to satisfy, in each case, the precautionary requests presented by both parties

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, the judge can take any of the measures indicated above. **There is, in effect, a principle of atypicality of the kinds of protection, including precautionary.**

The Bulgarian answer

Only suspension of execution is permissible. According to Art. 166 of the APC, this is permissible when it is necessary to ensure the life or health of citizens, to protect particularly important state or public interests, or if the implementation of the administrative act will cause significant or irreparable damage to the citizen.

4. What are the conditions for the acceptance of a precautionary request?

- The probable validity of the action
- The probable validity of the action together with a serious prejudice
- The prevalence of public or private interest, based on the results of the equilibrium/assessment
- The required prerequisites of trial law to accord precautionary measures vary according to the different types of litigation
- Other prerequisites (please specify)

Italian reply



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The precautionary order must motivate on the basis of the assessment of the appended prejudice and indicate the outlines, which, after brief examination, would lead to a reasonable forecast of a positive result for the application.

The Bulgarian answer

These are indicated in the answer to question 4

5. Can the judge force the petitioner to pay bail?

- Yes
- No
- If yes, in which cases?

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, in the event that as a result of the decision of a precautionary application irreversible effects result, the chamber can require the payment of bail, to which the concession or rejection of a precautionary measure can be subordinated. The concession or rejection of a precautionary measure cannot be subordinated to bail where the interlocutory application relates to fundamental human rights or other assets of constitutional relevance.

The Bulgarian answer

In cases where the appeal has a suspensive effect,

the administrative authority or the persons for whom the administrative act is favorable may request the court to allow its preliminary execution. The court may then set a bail as a precautionary measure.

6. Are precautionary measures generic?

- Yes
- No – are there some subjects in which precautionary measures are not admitted?
Which?

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, precautionary measures do have general applications insofar as they can be applied to all types of litigation.

The Bulgarian answer

As in the Italian legal system, precautionary measures are of general application and apply to all types of court proceedings before the administrative court.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

7. Can a precautionary request be introduced autonomously before the presentation of the main trial proceedings (*ante causam*)?

- Yes
- No

Italian reply

In the event of exceptional gravity and urgency, the party entitled to apply, even before the prior declaration of the appeal, may request the adoption of urgent, temporary measures which appear indispensable during the time required to bring an action on the merit and the precautionary request in the course of the proceedings.

The Bulgarian answer

According to Art. 166 of the APC, the request for suspension of the execution of the administrative act is admissible in any situation of the case. This may also be requested before the appeal against the administrative act is filed. It is admissible before all courts.

8. In the event of cautionary request *ante causam*, does the precautionary decision of the judge lose effectiveness?

- Yes, in the event that the interested party does not initiate main trial proceedings within the mandatory time-limit
- No, its effectiveness remains intact even if the main trial proceedings have not been initiated within the mandatory time-limit or even if the time-limit has expired

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, the provision of *ante causam* acceptance, however, loses effectiveness when, within fifteen days from issuance, the appeal with a precautionary request has not been notified. In all events, the measure conceded loses effectiveness after sixty days from the date of issue, after which, only those precautionary measures which have been confirmed or set out during the course of the litigation remain effective.

The Bulgarian answer

In case the request is made before filing the complaint and suspension of the execution of the administrative act is allowed, the precautionary measure depends on whether the complaint will be filed. In case the appeal is not filed within the term for appeal, the administrative act will enter into force and it becomes enforceable due to its legal force.

9. When dealing with the precautionary request, does your legal system provide for specific procedure?



Co-funded by
the European Union



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

- Yes (give details of the main characteristics with regard to : trial deadlines, type of decision, motivational burden, ways for establishing debate)
- No

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, provisions have been made for a fast-track procedure in closed session.

The Bulgarian answer

There are special procedural rules. The request shall be considered in closed session. The court shall rule immediately with a ruling, which may be appealed with a private appeal within 7 days of its announcement.

10. Is the precautionary decision taken unilaterally or collegiately?

- Unilaterally;
- Collegiately;
- Collegiately, but in the event of extreme urgency, the precautionary decision can be taken temporarily by means of a simple unilateral decree;

Italian reply

The decision is taken collegiately. In the event of extreme urgency, the precautionary decision can be made, as a temporary measure, by means of a simple unilateral decree.

The Bulgarian answer

The decision to suspend enforcement is taken by the court panel, which is competent to consider the appeal against the administrative act. If the court panel is single, it shall also rule on the request for suspension of enforcement. If it has three members, it shall rule on the request submitted to it. It is also possible for a five-member panel of the SAC to rule on a request for suspension of enforcement, if such was made during the cassation appeal of the court decision of the first instance court.

11. During the discussion of the precautionary request, can the judge directly define the judgement on the merit?

- Yes (explain in which conditions)
- No

Italian reply



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

During the discussion of the precautionary request, the chamber, having verified the comprehensiveness of the hearing and the investigation and having heard representations from both parties, may define the judgement on merit with a sentence in a simplified form, in closed session.

The Bulgarian answer

The court seised with a request for suspension of enforcement shall discuss only the circumstances surrounding this precautionary measure. When the ruling by which the court of first instance rules on the request for suspension of enforcement is appealed to the SAC, it may revoke the ruling and rule on the merits of the request for suspension of enforcement. He may thus set aside the refusal of the Court of First Instance to suspend enforcement and to suspend enforcement.

12. Can precautionary measures be challenged before the Supreme Court /Council of State?

- Yes
- Yes, but only if they pass a test of eligibility
- No

Italian reply

Going against the injunctions of the Regional Administrative Tribunals, appeal can be made to the Council of State, to be put forward within a time-limit of thirty days from the notification of the decree, or within sixty days after its publication.

The Bulgarian answer

The ruling of the administrative court on the request for suspension of the execution of the administrative act may be appealed before the SAC with a private appeal within 7 days from the notification.

13. Can the Supreme Administrative Court / Council of State, as a precautionary measure, suspend the judgements on the merit of a judge of a lower level?

- Yes
- No

Italian reply

In the Italian legal system, the Council of State can, as a precautionary measure, suspend the judgements on the merit of a judge of a lower level.



**Co-funded by
the European Union**



Consiglio di Stato



Italian Presidency of ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Présidence italienne de l'ACA-Europe 2021-2023
Presidenza italiana dell' ACA-Europe 2021-2023

The Bulgarian answer

The APC does not contain a procedural possibility to request suspension of execution of a decision rendered by an administrative court until the completion of the cassation appeal. Such a procedural possibility exists in the Civil Procedure Code, but in the administrative process this is inadmissible.

14. On average, how many precautionary decisions are taken every year by the Supreme Court/ Council of State in comparison to the overall number of decisions taken?

Italian reply

In the last two-year period (2019/2020), the average number of precautionary rulings was 6,953. They account for about 39% of total judgments.

The Bulgarian answer



**Co-funded by
the European Union**